

Design Review Board



Minutes

February 13, 2018
Council Chambers – Lower Level
57 East 1st Street
4:30 PM

A work session of the Design Review Board was held at the City of Mesa Council Chamber – Lower Level, 57 East 1st Street at 4:30 p.m.

Board Members Present:

Sean Banda- Chair
Randy Carter- Vice Chair
Bryan Sandstrom
Nicole Posten-Thompson
J. Seth Placko
Tracy Roedel

Staff Present:

John Wesley
Tom Ellsworth
Lesley Davis
Lisa Davis
Wahid Alam
Kim Steadman
Cassidy Welch
Evan Balmer
Ryan McCann
Mike Gildenstern

Board Members Absent:

None

Others Present:

George Pasquel
Ralph Pew
Scott Belford
Jeff Welker
Andrew Greybar
Violet Thornton
Boyd Thacker
Charmen Johnson
Phil Gollon
David Sloan
Ted Sparks
Craig Vossler
Jim Connelly
Roger Jenkins
Todd Taylor

Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes February 13, 2018

Chair Banda welcomed everyone to the Work Session at 4:30 p.m.

A.1. DRB18 - 00025 The 8700 block of East Broadway Road (south side)

LOCATION/ADDRESS:	Located on the southwest corner of Broadway Road and State Route 202 (Red Mountain Freeway)
REQUEST:	This is a review of a storage facility
COUNCIL DISTRICT:	District 5
OWNER:	Broadway and 202, LLC
APPLICANT:	Withey Morris, PLC
ARCHITECT:	George Pasquel
STAFF PLANNER:	Cassidy Welch

Discussion: The applicant, George Pasquel presented the project to the Board.

Charmen Johnson, 8653 E. Capri Avenue, was opposed to a two story building.

Chair Banda

- Liked the materiality, and diversity of material in architecture
- Like how the planned lighting was graded around 2 Lumens, as to not create glare on the adjacent neighborhood
- Encouraged use of more decorative lighting, especially around the perimeter
- Suggested that the monument sign to be designed by an architect to compliment the architecture and enhance the site

Vice Chair Carter

- Confirmed with Staff that 30' is the maximum allowed height in the zoning district
- Was concerned about using overly ornate lighting

Boardmember Posten-Thompson

- Suggested undulating the east, west, and south parapets like as shown on the northern parapets
- Was concerned about using overly ornate lighting

Boardmember Placko

- Suggested using a different, less thorny tree than the Texas Ebony trees planned along the circulation drive. Proposed Acacia, Eucalyptus, and other types of evergreen trees to maintain a screen from the adjacent properties
- Suggested a tree that has a more column-like shape as to not interfere with circulation

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
February 13, 2018**

A.2. DRB17-00365

The 1400 block of North Power Road (east side)

LOCATION/ADDRESS: Located north of the northeast corner of Brown Road and Power Road (east side)
REQUEST: This is a review of a storage facility
COUNCIL DISTRICT: District 5
OWNER: David T Darling PC, DM3, LLC
APPLICANT: Pew and Lake PLC
ARCHITECT: Ralph Pew
STAFF PLANNER: Kim Steadman

Discussion: The applicants Ralph Pew and Phil Gollon presented the project to the Board.

David Sloan, 6822 E. Halifax Drive, expressed concerned over a proposed use that is more intense than the surrounding large lot residential uses. Mr. Sloan also was concerned with the proposed height of the building, scale, monolithic shape and size, the lack of articulation, the quality of the streetscape frontage, and the lack of a transition to the existing residential neighborhood.

Ted Sparks, 7010 E. Halifax Drive, clarified with the Board that the site plan and ingress/egress concerns are not in the purview of the Design Review Board.

Planning Director Wesley confirmed for the Board that the transition and scale/massing concerns in relation to Power Road are relevant to the Design Review Board's review.

Craig Vossler, 1451 N. 75th Street, did not like the proposed colors and textured bricks. Mr. Vossler also felt that the circulation should not ingress/egress to Halifax Drive, and that the buildings are too long as shown, and that there is not a sufficient buffer to the neighborhood.

Jim Connelly, 6910 E. Halifax, felt that the building was too tall, and that the streets cannot handle the additional traffic

Roger Jenkins, 6834 E. Halifax, did not want to speak on the issue.

Chair Banda

- Felt that the building was sited too close to the property line, and that it doesn't fit the context in the mid-block area
- Felt that the design did not respond to the rural context of the neighbors to the east
- Proposed a modern agrarian type design; i.e. long, low-slung, truth in materials, etc.

Vice Chair Carter

- Liked the 25'-30' southern elevation palo verde/ mesquite tree landscape buffer idea
- Felt that the building doesn't fit the neighborhood, was too tall, and too large of scale
- Did not like the chosen colors, felt that they were out of context

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
February 13, 2018**

- Felt that the shape/form/architectural style is out of context with the surrounding community, and felt that it needed to be redesigned

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Felt that the height was inappropriate in this context, and didn't like the architecture
- Recommended that the applicant reach out to the neighbors to the east and get landscaping, wall height, depressed grade ideas

Boardmember Posten-Thompson

- Liked the 25'-30' southern elevation palo verde/ mesquite tree landscape buffer idea
- Felt that the building was too tall

Boardmember Roedel

- Felt that the building was too tall

Boardmember Placko

- Didn't like the landscape islands planned along the back wall, and felt that the trees could be placed closer to the building
- Didn't like how there was asphalt strips placed between the tree planters to the rear of the building, and suggested that a planter be placed there instead
- Suggested that the southern buffer should be 25'-30', and planted with mesquite/palo verde trees for screening purposes
- Suggested a "right-in, right-out" ingress/egress onto Power Road

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
February 13, 2018**

A.3. DRB17-00452 The 8400 block of East Guadalupe Road (south side)

LOCATION/ADDRESS: Located on the southeast corner of Hawes and Guadalupe Roads
REQUEST: This is a review of a multi-residential project
COUNCIL DISTRICT: District 6
OWNER: Snowdon Mesa, LLC
APPLICANT: Snowdon Residential, LLC
ARCHITECT: Scott Belford
STAFF PLANNER: Lisa Davis

Discussion: The applicant, Scott Belford presented the project to the Board.

Chair Banda

- Felt that there was not enough articulation/diversity in the architecture
- Liked the green court pocket parks
- Didn't agree with the architecture
- Like date palms and monuments at the entrance
- Suggested provided more garages for the luxury apartments
- Felt that the forms were too flat, and encouraged the applicant to work with Staff to come to a good modern design

Vice Chair Carter

- Was concerned about the vistas down the drive aisles, and felt that the garages were too flat, and needed more ins and outs
- Was concerned about the minimal metal projections over the doors, and a lack of projections on other elevations, as well
- Wanted to see more movement and articulation in the architecture
- Felt that the parking canopies were "weak" for the architecture

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Stated that the plans were insufficient for full review
- Didn't like the design, and felt that the project will not age well
- Didn't like the site plan, and felt that more could be done with the site by designing with open space first
- Didn't like the ground-mounted AC Units placement and mechanical walls shown on the site plan but not on elevations
- Suggested adding garages for the luxury apartments

Boardmember Posten-Thompson

- Concerned with color palette
- Felt that the "wood-tile" material could be used more effectively
- Was concerned about only providing 1 pool for a 121-unit apartment project
- Did not like the covered parking
- Didn't think the project would age well, and felt that it was too basic of a design
- The materials board was not updated and was incorrect for elevations

Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes February 13, 2018

Boardmember Placko

- Felt that the sightlines were too tight
- Suggested doing a sun study to be certain that the natural grass patches will be successful with the placement of the buildings
- Wanted more coordination between the renderings and the landscape plans
- Felt that other more traditional plant choices would handle shaded areas better than the desert plants suggested
- Recommended keeping spiny or thorny plants away from the sidewalks

The Board requested that the project be brought back for review with the changes discussed.

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
February 13, 2018**

A.4. DRB17-00553 The 1100 block of South Country Club Drive (west side)

LOCATION/ADDRESS: Located north of the northwest corner of Southern Avenue and Country Club Drive (west side)
REQUEST: This is a review of a water kiosk
COUNCIL DISTRICT: District 4
OWNER: C & C Plaza, LLC
APPLICANT: Welker Development Resources, LLC
ARCHITECT: Jeff Welker
STAFF PLANNER: Wahid Alam

Discussion: The applicant, Jeff Welker presented the project to the Board.

Chair Banda

- Suggested using “Trex”, a more modern wood material
- Suggested adding wainscoting at the bottom or an overhang using natural steel
- Proposed eliminating the arch at the top, and flat wall on the side
- Suggested a more contemporary color palette
- Proposed using a honed CMU on the bottom of the building

Vice Chair Carter

- Asked the applicant to not try to match the shopping center in case DRB17-00556

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Confirmed with the applicant that since DRB17-00553 and DRB17-00555 are the same model, that DRB17-00556 will be different
- Suggested using a different finish, like distressed material as found on an old barn
- Asked the applicant to not try to match the shopping center in case DRB17-00556
- Encouraged applicant to use the new Starbucks at Stapley and McKellips as inspiration
- Suggested using more metal materials
- Didn't like the design presented in Case DRB17-000556

Boardmember Posten-Thompson

- Confirmed that signage will be permitted separately
- Suggested using greys, browns, reds for the wood to create more of a “Cape Cod”-type feel

The Board requested that the applicant work with Staff

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
February 13, 2018**

A.5. DRB17-00555 The 1200 block of West University Drive (north side)

LOCATION/ADDRESS: Located west of the northwest corner of Alma School Road and University Drive (north side)
REQUEST: This is a review of a water kiosk
COUNCIL DISTRICT: District 3
OWNER: 1212 University LLC/Auret 1, LLC
APPLICANT: Welker Development Resources, LLC
ARCHITECT: Jeff Welker
STAFF PLANNER: Wahid Alam

Discussion: The applicant, Jeff Welker presented the project to the Board.

Chair Banda

- Suggested using “Trex”, a more modern wood material
- Suggested adding wainscoting at the bottom or an overhang using natural steel
- Proposed eliminating the arch at the top, and flat wall on the side
- Suggested a more contemporary color palette
- Proposed using a honed CMU on the bottom of the building

Vice Chair Carter

- Asked the applicant to not try to match the shopping center in case DRB17-00556

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Confirmed with the applicant that since DRB17-00553 and DRB17-00555 are the same model, that DRB17-00556 will be different
- Suggested using a different finish, like distressed material as found on an old barn
- Asked the applicant to not try to match the shopping center in case DRB17-00556
- Encouraged applicant to use the new Starbucks at Stapley and McKellips as inspiration
- Suggested using more metal materials
- Didn't like the design presented in Case DRB17-000556

Boardmember Posten-Thompson

- Confirmed that signage will be permitted separately
- Suggested using greys, browns, reds for the wood to create more of a “Cape Cod”-type feel

The Board requested that the applicant work with Staff

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
February 13, 2018**

A.6. DRB17-00556 The 300 block of East Southern Avenue (south side)

LOCATION/ADDRESS: Located west of the southwest corner of Mesa Drive and Southern Ave (south side).
REQUEST: This is a review of a water kiosk
COUNCIL DISTRICT: District 4
OWNER: Red Mountain Asset Fund II, LLC
APPLICANT: Welker Development Resources, LLC
ARCHITECT: Jeff Welker
STAFF PLANNER: Wahid Alam

Discussion: The applicant, Jeff Welker presented the project to the Board.

Chair Banda

- Suggested using “Trex”, a more modern wood material
- Suggested adding wainscoting at the bottom or an overhang using natural steel
- Proposed eliminating the arch at the top, and flat wall on the side
- Suggested a more contemporary color palette
- Proposed using a honed CMU on the bottom of the building

Vice Chair Carter

- Asked the applicant to not try to match the shopping center in case DRB17-00556

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Confirmed with the applicant that since DRB17-00553 and DRB17-00555 are the same model, that DRB17-00556 will be different
- Suggested using a different finish, like distressed material as found on an old barn
- Asked the applicant to not try to match the shopping center in case DRB17-00556
- Encouraged applicant to use the new Starbucks at Stapley and McKellips as inspiration
- Suggested using more metal materials
- Didn't like the design presented in Case DRB17-000556

Boardmember Posten-Thompson

- Confirmed that signage will be permitted separately
- Suggested using greys, browns, reds for the wood to create more of a “Cape Cod”-type feel

The Board requested that the applicant work with Staff

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
February 13, 2018**

A.7. DRB17-00586

The 500-600 Block of West Baseline Road (south side)

LOCATION/ADDRESS: Located east of the southeast corner of Extension and Baseline Roads (south side)
REQUEST: This is a review of a medical office building
COUNCIL DISTRICT: District 3
OWNER: Mesa GI Holdings, LLC
APPLICANT: LGE Design Gorup, LLC
ARCHITECT: Andrew Greybar
STAFF PLANNER: Cassidy Welch

Discussion: The applicant, Andrew Greybar presented the project to the Board.

Shaun Johnson, 608 W. Keats Ave., suggested requiring frosted windows on the 2nd story component of the new building, to maintain privacy for all the neighbors, and that the design was too boxy. He also suggested moving the generator from the south side of the property to limit noise trespass to the adjacent homes. He also wanted to see more trees, especially along the south side of the property, to create more of a screen. He closed by asking that the paint used for the project is not reflective.

Chair Banda

- Suggested that the applicant only use clerestory windows where the building faces the existing residential properties
- Felt that articulation was needed on the rear of the building
- Suggested undulating the proposed gabion wall to break up the line
- Suggested not using quarter minus as ground covering as it is prone to wash away
- Confirmed that there will be downlighting on the façade of the project, and suggested that the lighting be rated to around the 3000 Kelvin range, to create a more ambient glow
- Liked the design and color palette

Vice Chair Carter

- Suggested narrowing home-facing windows, and placing them above 6' for privacy concerns

Boardmember Sandstrom

- Suggested using a gabion wall on the site, like the one in the development across Baseline (north side)
- Suggested taking inspiration from the elements out front when designing signage, lighting, sidewalls around the site
- Suggested beefing up the screening to the south with landscaping

Boardmember Posten-Thompson

- Felt that the building lacks undulation on the south and west side, and suggested using some of the elements out front on the more mundane elevations
- Suggested using more wood elements
- Proposed using an edging/trim piece on the covered parking, and the materials should complement the rest of the architecture

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
February 13, 2018**

Boardmember Placko

- Suggested planting more trees along Baseline Road, and cautioned against the lower-hanging pistache trees proposed
- Suggested filling in the sidewalk by the screen walk with landscaping
- Suggested not using mastics by the front entrance, as they may impede pedestrian traffic
- Suggested using willow acacia for the perimeter
- Suggested using a gabion anchor site wall and relating the orientation to the architecture
- Advised that some trees were located in the sight visibility triangle, and suggested relocating those trees to fill the gap directly west

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
February 13, 2018**

A.8. DRB17-00587

The 3200 block of North Recker Road (west side)

LOCATION/ADDRESS: The southwest corner of State Route 202 and Recker Road (west side).
REQUEST: This is a review of a retail pad building
COUNCIL DISTRICT: District 5
OWNER: Longbow CAS, LLC
APPLICANT: Kitchell Development Corporation, LLC
ARCHITECT: Rob Schramm/Violet Thornton
STAFF PLANNER: Jennifer Gniffke

Discussion: The applicants, Rob Schramm and Violet Thornton presented the project to the Board.

Randy Rostron, 3140 N. Olympic, stated that he had no problem with the finishes, but didn't like the entry to the building was oriented to the southeast. Mr. Rostron went on to say that the light fixtures that have been instead at the anchor site (Building B), have not been mounted level, and that the exit lights above the door on Building B can be seen from across the street. Mr. Rostron closed by saying that the mechanical units on top of the newly-constructed Sprouts grocery store are not properly screened.

Vice Chair Carter

- Liked the articulation and colors of the project

Boardmember Roedel

- Liked the building

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
February 13, 2018**

A.9. DRB17-00592 The 800 block of North Gilbert Road (east side)

LOCATION/ADDRESS: Located south of the southeast corner Gilbert Road (east side)
REQUEST: This is a review of a lawn and garden retail center
COUNCIL DISTRICT: District 1
OWNER: Mellet Laurel
APPLICANT: Brock Craig & Thacker Architects
ARCHITECT: Boyd H. Thacker
STAFF PLANNER: Lisa Davis

Discussion: The applicant, Boyd H. Thacker presented the project to the Board.

Chair Banda

- Suggested using more articulation and movement in the architecture at the east elevation
- Liked the clerestory windows
- Liked the idea of incorporating more green into the color palette
- Confirmed with the applicant that Bobcats, trenchers, etc. were to be stored under the front canopy at night through the use of a Special Use Permit

Vice Chair Carter

- Liked the design of the building
- Felt that more trees, (2 to 3) planted closer together to screen building on the east side were necessary, and suggested planting a few more trees along the Gilbert Road frontage as well
- Felt that the eastern elevation was too flat, and needed more articulation
- Felt that a better sign design that ties into the design of the building was needed
- Liked the idea of adding green to the building
- Stated that the landscape plan needs to be revised to consistent with the renderings

Boardmember Posten-Thompson

- Suggested to add green on the building, perhaps on the vertical panels near the entry
- Suggested using the architecture to influence the signage

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
February 13, 2018**

A.10. DRB18-00070 3309 North Reseda

LOCATION/ADDRESS: Located south and east of Recker Road and the Arizona State
Route 202 (Red Mountain Freeway).
REQUEST: This is a review of a new warehouse/production facility
COUNCIL DISTRICT: District 5
OWNER: ATK Gun Systems Company
APPLICANT: Deutsch Architecture Group
ARCHITECT: Leo Marin
STAFF PLANNER: Lesley Davis

Discussion: Continued to March 13, 2018

**Design Review Board – Work Session Minutes
February 13, 2018**

B. Call to Order

Vice Chair Carter called the meeting to order at 7:07 pm

C. Discuss and review the following Design Review cases for action at the February 13, 2018 Meeting:
NONE

D. Consider the Minutes from the January 9, 2018 meeting

On a motion by Boardmember Posten-Thompson and seconded by Boardmember Roedel, the Board unanimously approved the January 9, 2018 minutes.

(Vote: 5-0) (Chair Banda was excused before the Meeting was called to order)

E. Other Business:

Received a presentation on the updated Sign Code from Staffmember Angelica Guevara

F. Adjournment

Meeting was adjourned.

The City of Mesa is committed to making its public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. For special accommodations, please contact the City Manager's Office at (480) 644-3333 or AzRelay 7-1-1 at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting. **Si necesita asistencia o traducción en español, favor de llamar al menos 48 horas antes de la reunión al 480-644-2767.**